

Nonclassical Carbocations

From Controversy to Convention

A Stoltz Group Literature Meeting brought to you by

Chris Gilmore



н

June 26, 2006 8 PM 147 Noyes







Outline

1. Introduction

- 2. The Nonclassical Carbocation Controversy
 - Winstein, Brown, and the Great Debate
 - George Olah and ending the discussion
 - Important nonclassical carbocations
- 3. The Nature of the Nonclassical Carbocation
 - The 3-center, 2-electron bond
 - Cleaving C-C and C-H $\sigma\text{-bonds}$
 - Intermediate or Transition state? Changing the way we think about carbocations
- 4. Carbocations, nonclassical intermediates, and synthetic chemistry
 - Biosynthetic Pathways
 - Steroids, by W.S. Johnson
 - Corey's foray into carbocationic cascades
 - Interesting rearrangements
 - Overman and the Prins-Pinacol

Carbocations: An Introduction

Traditional carbocation is a low-valent, trisubstituted electron-deficient carbon center:



Modes of stabilization:



Outline

1. Introduction

- 2. The Nonclassical Carbocation Controversy
 - Winstein, Brown, and the Great Debate
 - George Olah and ending the discussion
 - Important nonclassical carbocations
- 3. The Nature of the Nonclassical Carbocation
 - The 3-center, 2-electron bond
 - Cleaving C-C and C-H $\sigma\text{-bonds}$
 - Intermediate or Transition state? Changing the way we think about carbocations
- 4. Carbocations, nonclassical intermediates, and synthetic chemistry
 - Biosynthetic Pathways
 - Steroids, by W.S. Johnson
 - Corey's foray into carbocationic cascades
 - Interesting rearrangements
 - Overman and the Prins-Pinacol

The Nonclassical Problem: Early Curiosities



Ruzicka, L. Helv. Chim. Acta, 1918, 1, 110.

Winstein and Trifan, 1949

Rates of solvolysis





Winstein, Trifan. J. Am. Chem. Soc., 1949, 71, 2953.

Winstein and Trifan, 1949

Rates of solvolysis



350

Enantiomerically pure starting material...



Winstein, Trifan. J. Am. Chem. Soc., 1949, 71, 2953.

Winstein and Trifan, 1949

Rates of solvolysis





"It is attractive to account for these results by way of the bridged (nonclassical) formulation for the norbornyl cation involving accelerated rate of formation from the exo precursor by anchimeric assistance." -Saul Winstein



"It is attractive to account for these results by way of the bridged (nonclassical) formulation for the norbornyl cation involving accelerated rate of formation from the exo precursor by anchimeric assistance." -Saul Winstein



The Response of the Traditionalists- H. C. Brown

Strain release improves exo to endo ratio:



Not only must strain have some impact, but direct ionization hinders rate of solvolysis of *endo* norbornyl system.





endo

Solvolysis proceeds through unassisted ionization:

- relief of strain accelerates endo ionization
- steric effects hinder ionization of endo isomer
- exo is not fast, endo is slow

Exo/Endo

Brown, H.C. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1964, 86, 1248-1250.

A Bonding Experience- Brown's Challenge

Brown insisted upon two stable, equilibrating classical carbocaitonic forms for the norbornyl cation:



"The norbornyl cation does not possess sufficient electrons to provide a pair for all of the bonds required by the proposed bridged structures. One must propose a new bonding concept, not yet established in carbon structures." - H. C. Brown, 1965

A Bonding Experience- Brown's Challenge

Brown insisted upon two stable, equilibrating classical carbocaitonic forms for the norbornyl cation:



"The norbornyl cation does not possess sufficient electrons to provide a pair for all of the bonds required by the proposed bridged structures. One must propose a new bonding concept, not yet established in carbon structures." - H. C. Brown, 1965

So, if not classical carbenium ions, what must nonclassical carbocations be?



Brown, H. C. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **1965**, *87*, 2137-2153. P.D. Bartlett, *Nonclassical Ions*, W.A. Benjamin, New York, 1965.

A Bonding Experience- Brown's Challenge

Brown insisted upon two stable, equilibrating classical carbocaitonic forms for the norbornyl cation:



"The norbornyl cation does not possess sufficient electrons to provide a pair for all of the bonds required by the proposed bridged structures. One must propose a new bonding concept, not yet established in carbon structures." - H. C. Brown, 1965

So, if not classical carbenium ions, what must nonclassical carbocations be?



Contain too few electrons to allow a pair for each "bond"; must have delocalized σ electrons

P.D. Bartlett, Nonclassical Ions, W.A. Benjamin, New York, 1965.

Enter George Olah

- Previous work with isolable carbocations possible because of superacids and stable ion media.
- Isolated the first stable carbocation in 1964 and was able to characterize with ¹³C NMR



¹³C shift was 300 ppm downfield from SM! (335.2 ppm)

- Superacids designed to prevent proton elimination to quench carbocations



- pKa's are measured anhydrously by Hammet acidiy function H_o

	<u>H</u> o
anhydrous sulfuric acid	-11.9
perchloric acid	-13.0
triflic acid	-14.1
magic acid (FSO ₃ H·SbF ₅)	-21.0

Superacids can reach acidities of H_o = -28, or 10¹⁶ times acidity of anhydrous sulfuric acid.



¹H NMR Studies of Olah, Saunders and Schleyer



Broad singlet corresponds to fast Wagner-Meerwein and hydride shifts, -3.75 – -3.1 ppm

Resolves 3 singlets, 4:1:6 at -5.35, -3.15, -2.20 ppm

Shows 2-norbornyl ion stable in solution as equilibrating Wagner-Meerwein shifts OR mesomeric intermediate

¹H NMR Studies of Olah, Saunders and Schleyer



Saunders, M.; Schleyer, P.; Olah, G. A. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1964, 86, 5680.





Core Electron Spectroscopy for Chemical Analysis (ESCA)

- Exploits photoelectric effect to measure ion affinity for electrons.
- Trivalent classical carbocation shows charge localization on 1 atom increases e⁻ binding energy by ~5eV
- Timescale is ~ 10^{18} Hz, much faster than NMR and Wagner-Meerwein shifts



Olah, G. A.; Mateescu, L. A. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **1970**, *92*, 7231. Olah, G. A.; Mateescu, L. A. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **1972**, *94*, 2529.

Core Electron Spectroscopy for Chemical Analysis (ESCA)

- Exploits photoelectric effect to measure ion affinity for electrons.
- Trivalent classical carbocation shows charge localization on 1 atom increases e⁻ binding energy by ~5eV
- Timescale is ~ 10¹⁸ Hz, much faster than NMR and Wagner-Meerwein shifts



Olah, G. A.; Mateescu, L. A. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **1970**, *92*, 7231. Olah, G. A.; Mateescu, L. A. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **1972**, *94*, 2529.

Closing the Debate











- Parent for all nonclassical carbocations.
- 8 Valence electrons rendered deficient by electron pair sharing between 3 atoms

Geometry:

- initially suggested trigonal bipyramidal structure
- *Ab initio* calculations postulated C_s symmetry (as shown)
- Low bond-bond proton migration barriers lend to completely delocalized theory of bonding



Olah, G. A.; Klopman, G. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1969, 91, 3261



Roberts, J.D.; et. al. J. Am. Che. Soc. 1951, 73, 3542.







¹H NMR study of norbornadienyl model system proved nonequivalence of protons in norbornenyl cation



Winstein, S.; Brookhart, M. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1972, 94, 2347.



Aromatic group participation

Walden Inversion:



Cram, D. D. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1949, 71, 3183











cyclopropyl assistance

Properties of Cyclopropane are similar to an olefin:







Tsuji, et. al. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1967, 89, 1953.; Wells, et. al. Tetrahedron, 1966, 22, 2007.

Outline

1. Introduction

- 2. The Nonclassical Carbocation Controversy
 - Winstein, Brown, and the Great Debate
 - George Olah and ending the discussion
 - Important nonclassical carbocations
- 3. The Nature of the Nonclassical Carbocation
 - The 3-center, 2-electron bond
 - Cleaving C-C and C-H $\sigma\text{-bonds}$
 - Intermediate or Transition state? Changing the way we think about carbocations
- 4. Carbocations, nonclassical intermediates, and synthetic chemistry
 - Biosynthetic Pathways
 - Steroids, by W.S. Johnson
 - Corey's foray into carbocationic cascades
 - Interesting rearrangements
 - Overman and the Prins-Pinacol

The 3-Center, 2-electron Bond

Diborane and the stable 3-center 2-electron bond.



- Borane dimers consist of two 3-center 2-electron bonds - Delocalized electron-poor region at center of dimer



Electon-poor carbon analogs: π-bond donors

Postulated first by DeWar in 1945 as π -complex



Cationic π -complexes and MO theory





Protonating an Alkane



Mota, et. al. *J. Phys. Chem. B* **2001**, *105*, 4331. Ramsden *Tetrahedron* **2004**, *60*, 3293. Olah, et al. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed. Eng.* **1973**, *12*, 173.

Protonating an Alkane

Much less nucleophilic than π -bonds, σ C-C and C-H bonds donate as well:

Linear or bridged transition state in σ protonation?





Olah, et al. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **1971**, *93*, 1251. Hogeveen, et al. *Recl. Trav. Chim. Pays-Bas.* **1969**, *88*, 703. Olah, et al. *Angew. Chem. Int. Ed. Eng.* **1973**, *12*, 173.

The 3-center, 2-electron bond changes how all carbocations are precieved

Ethyl cation: hyperconjugation or hypervalence?



- Carbenium ions are prone to rearrangement
- Rapid scrambling of 5 H's in ethyl cation indicative of some delocalized intermediate
- Hydride shifts in such cations are illustrative of the low energy barriers between cabenium and carbonium ions
- Carbonium intermediate is calculated as favorable for all but most stabilized carbocations

The 3-center, 2-electron bond changes how all carbocations are precieved

Ethyl cation: hyperconjugation or hypervalence?



- Carbenium ions are prone to rearrangement
- Rapid scrambling of 5 H's in ethyl cation indicative of some delocalized intermediate
- Hydride shifts in such cations are illustrative of the low energy barriers between cabenium and carbonium ions
- Carbonium intermediate is calculated as favorable for all but most stabilized carbocations

The 3-center, 2-electron bond changes how all carbocations are precieved

Ethyl cation: hyperconjugation or hypervalence?



- Carbenium ions are prone to rearrangement
- Rapid scrambling of 5 H's in ethyl cation indicative of some delocalized intermediate
- Hydride shifts in such cations are illustrative of the low energy barriers between cabenium and carbonium ions
- Carbonium intermediate is calculated as favorable for all but most stabilized carbocations

The 3-center, 2-electron bond changes how all carbocations are precieved

Ethyl cation: hyperconjugation or hypervalence?



Wagner-Meerwein shifts and isomerization



- Carbenium ions are prone to rearrangement
- Rapid scrambling of 5 H's in ethyl cation indicative of some delocalized intermediate
- Hydride shifts in such cations are illustrative of the low energy barriers between cabenium and carbonium ions
- Carbonium intermediate is calculated as favorable for all but most stabilized carbocations

- 1 ¹³C NMR Shift at -139 °C
 Rearrangements occur ~ 3.1 x 10⁷ Hz

A Whole New Ballgame...

Delocalized intermediates also participate in assisting leaving group departure



Many of the carbocationic rearrangements basic to organic chemistry can be associated with nonclassical carbocationic intermediates.

Outline

1. Introduction

- 2. The Nonclassical Carbocation Controversy
 - Winstein, Brown, and the Great Debate
 - George Olah and ending the discussion
 - Important nonclassical carbocations
- 3. The Nature of the Nonclassical Carbocation
 - The 3-center, 2-electron bond
 - Cleaving C-C and C-H $\sigma\text{-bonds}$
 - Intermediate or Transition state? Changing the way we think about carbocations
- 4. Carbocations, nonclassical intermediates, and synthetic chemistry
 - Biosynthetic Pathways
 - Steroids, by W.S. Johnson
 - Corey's foray into carbocationic cascades
 - Interesting rearrangements
 - Overman and the Prins-Pinacol

Carbocationic Cascades- Biosynthesis



Tantillo J. Am. Chem. Soc. 2006, 128, 6172.

Carbocationic Cascades- Biosynthesis



W.S. Johnson's Approach to Steroid Skeletons



W.S. Johnson's Approach to Steroid Skeletons



Carbocationic Cascades- Corey and Oleananes



Corey, E.J J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1993, 115, 8873-8874

Some other unique rearrangements



Corey, E. J.; Roberts, B.E. Tetrahedron Lett. 1997, 38, 8921.

Some other unique rearrangements

R

R0,,,

....Ô

•Om

0

ΆR

. 0

0"

О





Lartey, et. al. J. Org. Chem. 1996, 61, 5153.

Some other unique rearrangements



Lartey, et. al. J. Org. Chem. 1996, 61, 5153.

Cationic Cascade to Longifolene



Johnson, W. S., et. al. *J. Am. Chem. Soc.* **1975**, *97*, 4777. Tantillo, D. J., et al. *J. Org. Chem.* **2005**, *70*, 5139.



Overman, L. E. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1993, 115, 2992.



Overman, L. E. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 1993, 115, 2992.





Overman, L.E. J. Am. Chem. Soc. 2001, 123, 4851

Summary and Parting Thoughts

- The nonclassical carbocation controversy opened the realm of physical organic chemistry, established the idea of delocalized, electron-poor bonding in intermediates and transition states for organic reactions, and encouraged an intense debate that has led to the affirmation of many instrumental and experimental techniques used today

- The 3-center, 2-electron bond is prevalent in carbocation chemistry, often as a stable intermediate or transition state, and sometimes as a stable molecule itself

- Carbocation chemistry and its variants have found an effective place in synthesis, but there exists a large gap in controlled carbocationic methodology that has only recently been explored.

Thanks to JT for the Carbocation book and Meyer for helpful advice